PROPOSAL EVALUATION

Proposition 1E Integrated Regional Water Management (IRWM) Grant Program

Stormwater Flood Management Grant, Round 1, 2010-2011

Applicant City of Escondido

Amount Requested $14,900,000

Proposal Title The City of Escondido - Lake Wohlford Dam Replacement Project

Total Proposal Cost $30,698,100

PROPOSAL SUMMARY

The proposed project would construct an earth-core rockfill dam to replace the existing 114-year old Lake Wohlford Dam, which was originally constructed in 1895. The existing Lake Wohlford Dam has been deemed seismically unsound by the Federal Energy Regulatory Commission and the DWR's Safety of Dams, and could fail even in a relatively small seismic event. Due to seismic-related safety issues, the City of Escondido is required to retain Lake Wohlford at 2,800 AF, well below its 6,500 AF capacity.

PROPOSAL SCORE

Criteria	Score/ Max. Possible	Criteria	Score/ Max. Possible
Work Plan	**15/15**	Economic Analysis – Flood Damage Reduction and Water Supply Benefits	**9/12**
Budget	**3/5**	Water Quality and Other Expected Benefits	**6/12**
Schedule	**1/5**	Program Preferences	**6/10**
Monitoring, Assessment, and Performance Measures	**4/5**		
		Total Score (max. possible = 64)	**44**

EVALUATION SUMMARY

Work Plan

The criterion is fully addressed and supported by well-presented documentation and logical rationale. All tasks identified in the Work Plan are appropriate. The Project is currently at a conceptual design phase; therefore, no detailed plans or specifications are provided. However, a conceptual site plan and dam cross section are included that provide the location of the Project and design information that is consistent with the tasks and descriptions included in the Work Plan. Sufficient documentation is provided on the studies and technical evaluations conducted to determine the appropriate dam replacement type and the steps necessary to implement the replacement project.

Budget

Summary and detailed Budget information is provided for most items; however, it is difficult for reviewers to judge this information given the project is at a conceptual stage. A lump sum cost of $20 million dollars for the construction of the dam is not supported by sufficient rationale or documentation. Additionally, the City of Escondido does not currently have matching funds. The match will be met by the City obtaining federal appropriations or issuance of municipal bonds.

Schedule

Project construction is not estimated to start until February 4, 2014, over two years from the anticipated award date (October 1, 2011).

Monitoring, Assessment, and Performance Measures

The criterion is fully addressed, but is not supported by thorough documentation or sufficient rationale. More quantitative metrics should have been used. For example, a quantitative metric could have been used for the benefit type "Reduction in Stormwater and Discharge Flows." More information on the degree of change in discharge flows and how the dam would be operated to achieve the target flows should have been provided. The target for the benefit type of "Reduced Flooding," which could also be seen as risk reduction, could be the new level of protection for the new dam.

Economic Analysis – Flood Damage Reduction (FDR) and Water Supply Benefits

High levels of FDR and water supply benefits can be realized through this Proposal; however, the quality of the analysis is partially lacking and/or supporting documentation is partially unsubstantiated. Total NPV of costs is $23.491 million. FDR claimed benefits are $14.13 million, and water supply claimed benefits are $52.621 million. FDR benefits are based on an inundation area based on a full reservoir, but the reservoir currently cannot be operated at capacity. The water supply benefit is based on average supply reduction for the water years 2008 through 2010. These were generally dry years, so part of the 3,866 AFY claimed could be due to drought, not the FERC restrictions.

Economic Analysis – Water Quality and Other Expected Benefits

Average levels of Water Quality and Other benefits can be realized through this Proposal; however, the quality of the analysis is partially lacking and/or supporting documentation is partially unsubstantiated. The analysis does not claim monetized water quality and other benefits. Benefits are associated with reduced chance of dam failure and associated scouring and sediment damage, recreation benefits would be provided by the larger lake surface area, and the amount of habitat available for fish would be increased. Purposes of the project are "water supply, flood control, power generation and recreation." The additional usable capacity should provide a hydropower benefit; it is not clear why this benefit is not claimed.

Program Preferences

The Proposal includes a project that implements the following Program Preferences: Include regional projects or programs, Effectively Resolve Significant Water-related Conflicts within or between Regions, Contribute to Attainment of One or More of the Objectives of the CALFED Bay-Delta Program, Drought Preparedness, Expand Environmental Stewardship, and Protect Surface Water and Ground Quality. However, the Proposal demonstrates a limited degree of certainty that the Program Preferences claimed can be achieved, and lacks thorough documentation for the breadth and magnitude of the Program Preferences to be implemented.